IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF CABELL COUNTY, WEST MIRGINIA

JEANNE CARTWRIGHT, AS GUARDIAN AND PARENT OF TIFFANY CARTWRIGHT, A MINOR CHILD,

ST VIRGINIA U U E

Plaintiff.

CASE NO.: 03-C-0331 David Pancake, Judge

CARL F. MCCOMAS, M.D., and CABELL HUNTINGTON HOSPITAL,

Defendant.

ORDER GRANTING SUMMARY JUDGMENT TO CABELL HUNTINGTON HOSPITAL, INC.

On June 21, 2007, came the parties by counsel upon Defendant, Cabell Huntington Hospital, Inc.'s Motion For Summary Judgment. After due consideration of written and oral arguments by counsel, as well as the applicable law, this Court hereby makes the following Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law:

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. On October 29, 2002, this case was filed against Carl McComas, M.D., under the Medical Professional Liability Act 2002 ("MPLA II").
- 2. The Medical Professional Liability Act 2003 ("MPLA III") applies to all causes of action alleging medical professional liability which are filed on or after the first day of July, two thousand three. W.Va. Code §55-7B-1, et.seq.
- 3. On June 15, 2005, this case was filed against Cabell Huntington Hospital, Inc., under the MPLA III.
- 4. The Plaintiff disclosed four (4) expert witnesses as well as multiple treating physicians to offer opinions regarding standard of care and causation.

ET, CHAIG & YON, PLIC ATTORNEYS at LAW 611 TOTA ST., SUITE 500 HUMOROTON, WY

- 5. No witness or treating physician named by any party to this cause of action has opined that an employee of Cabell Huntington Hospital deviated from the acceptable standard of care causing harm to Tiffany Cartwright.
- 6. Plaintiff has offered no evidence that employees of Cabell Huntington Hospital were negligent in the care of Tiffany Cartwright.
- 7. Section §55-7B-9(g) of the MPLA III, states that a health care provider may not be held vicariously liable for the acts of a non-employee pursuant to a theory of ostensible agency unless the alleged agent does not maintain professional liability insurance covering the medical injury which is the subject of the action in the aggregate amount of at least one million dollars.
- 8. Carl McComas, M.D. is an employee of Tri-State Neuroscience Center and not an employee of Cabell Huntington Hospital.
- 9. Carl McComas maintained professional liability insurance covering the medical injury which is the subject of the Cartwright litigation in the aggregate amount of one million dollars. Therefore Cabell Huntington Hospital is not vicariously liable for the actions or omissions of Dr. McComas in this cause of action.
- 10. Plaintiff has not met her burden of proof that Cabell Huntington Hospital was negligent in this case.
- 11. There is no genuine issue of material fact regarding the liability of Cabell Huntington Hospital in this cause of action
- 12. The MPLA III is clear, unambiguous and the Legislative intent is plain. Therefore, the statute is presumed to be constitutional.

WHEREFORE it is hereby ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED, that
Defendant, Cabell Huntington Hospital, Inc.'s Motion For Summary Judgment is GRANTED
and it is dismissed from the Civil Action.

The Court directs the Clerk to send a copy of this Order to counsel of record.

ENTERED this 2nd of July, 2007.

Honorable David M. Pancake

s Judge Cabell County Circuit Court

COUNTY OF CABELL.

I, ADELL CHANDLER, CLERK OF THE CIRCUIT COURT FOR THE CGUNTY AND STATE AFORESAID DO HEREBY CERTIFY THAT THE FOREGOING IS A TRUE COPY FROM THE RECORDS OF SAID COURT ENTERED ON

COURT THIS JUN 3 - 2007

Adell Chaudh, CLERK CIRCUIT COURT OF CABELL COUNTY, WEST-VIRGINIA

PREPARED FOR ENTRY BY:

Rebecca C. Brown, Esquire (WV 7321)

Thomas L. Craig, Esquire (WV 859)

BAILES, CRAIG & YON, PLLC

Post Office Box 1926

Huntington, West Virginia 25720-1926

Counsel for Defendant, Cabell Huntington Hospital, Inc.

APPROVED FOR ENTRY:

Brian Alan Prim, Esquire/Anthony J. D'Amico, Esquire

Prim Law Firm, PLLC /Savinis, D'Amico & Kane, LLC

P.O. Box 430

Hurricane, WV 25526

Counsel for Plaintiffs

Steven K. Nord, Esquire

Offutt, Fisher & Nord

949 Third Avenue, Ste. 300

P.O. Box 2868

Huntington, WV 25728-2868

Attorney for Defendant, Carl F. McComas, M.D.

3

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF CABELL COUNTY, WEST VIRGINIA

JEANNE CARTWRIGHT, AS GUARDIAN AND PARENT OF TIFFANY CARTWRIGHT, A MINOR CHILD,

Plaintiff,

Vs.

CASE NO.: 03-C-0331 JUDGE DAVID PANCAKE

CARL F. MCCOMAS, M.D., and CABELL HUNTINGTON HOSPITAL, INC.,

Defendants.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the DOCKETING STATEMENT was served by United States Mail on the 2nd day of August, 2007 upon the following:

Thomas L. Craig, Esquire Rebecca C. Brown, Esquire BAILES, CRAIG & YON PO Box 1926 Huntington, WV 25720-1926

Steven K. Nord, Esquire OFFUTT, FISHER & NORD PO Box 2868 Huntington, WV 25728-2868

Brian A. Prim

PRIM LAW FIRM, PLLC

PO Box 430

30 Chase Drive

Hurricane, WV 25526

304-201-2425

Facsimile: 304-201-2430

E-mail: bprim@primlaw.com